Problems of the B' tone in Proto-Karen (PK)

Theraphan Luangthongkum Department of Linguistics, C.U.

Paper presented at SEALS 23, organised by the Department of Linguistics, Faculty of Arts, Chulalongkorn University, Bangkok, Thailand, May 29-31, 2013.

Extracted from "A view on Proto-Karen phonology and lexicon" (ms.)

Different opinions on the PK tones (1)

- Jones (1961): 2 tones (* ´and * `in both non-checked and checked syllables)
- Burling (1969): 6 tones (4 in non-checked syllables and 2 in checked syllables)
- Haudricourt (1946): 3 tones (2, i.e. *A and *B in nonchecked syllables and *C in checked syllables)

(1975): 4 tones (3, i.e. *A [level], *B [falling] and *B' [rising] in non- checked syllables and *C in checked syllables)

Different opinions on the PK tones (2)

- Solnit (2001): 4 tones (3, i.e. *A, *B and *B' in nonchecked syllables and *D in checked syllables)
- Shintani (2003): 4 tones (3, i.e. *1, *2 and *2' in nonchecked syllables and *3 in checked syllables)
- Manson (2009, 2011): 4 tones (3, i.e. *A [high], *B [low] and *B' [mid] in non-checked syllables and *C [mid+glottal] in checked syllables)

PK tones and their developments (1)

N.Karen

N.	P	a_(\mathbf{O}
T 10	_ ($f{\ }$

	*A	*B	*D
1			
2	31"	55	21'
3	33	53	45'

S. Pa-O

	*A	*B	*D
1			
2	31"	33	21'
3	53	55	45'

PK tones and their developments (2)

C. Karen

Kayan

	*A	*B	* D
1			470
2	53	11	45'
3	33		21'

W. Bwe

	*A	*B	*D
1			
2	55	33	
3			11

E. Kayah

	*A	*B	*D
1	22		
2	33	11	55
3			33

Kayaw

	*A	*B	*D
1			
2	55	11	33
3	33		

PK tones and their developments (3)

S. Karen

N. Sgaw

	*A	*B	*D
1		247	450
2	33	31~	45'
3		11"	21'

N. Pwo

	*A	*B	*D
1	35	22	4.50
2		33	45'
3	55	11"	21'

S. Sgaw

	*A	*B	*D
1		470	211
2	55	45'	21'
3	33	31	11"

S. Pwo

	*A	*B	*D
1	53		
2	2411	55	21'
3	31"	33	45'

Tones in four Sgaw varieties

(1)

*A *B *D

1
2 33 11"
45'
3 21'

	(2)			
	*A	*B	* D	
1				
2	33	31~/21'	45'	
3		11"	21'/53	

*A *B *D

1
55
2
11"
3 33
21'

	*A	*B	*D		
1					
2	55	45'	21'		
3	33	31	11"		

(4)

Unusual split in the B column

(Sgaw variety spoken in Ban Mueang Paeng, Amphoe Pai, Mae Hong Son)

	* A	*B	*D
1		11" ←	45'
2	33	21'	45
3		11" —	53

- 3 tones in non-checked syllables: 33 (< *A), 11"(< *B), and 53 (< *D)
- 2 tones in checked syllables: 21' (< *B) and 45' (< *D)

Examples of the B2 tone in Mueang Paeng Sgaw

	PK	MP Sgaw		
left side	*ce ^B	ce ^{? 21} / ce ²¹		
dung, excrement	*?e B	${}^{9}e^{?}$ 21 / ${}^{9}e$ 21'		
close (one's eyes)	*? bi ^B	bi ^{? 21} / bi ²¹		
frog	*?de B	de ^{? 21} / de ²¹		

Tone *B'

	N.Karen		C. Karen			S. K	S. Karen	
	S. Pa-O	Kayan	Kayah	Kayaw	Bwe	N. Pwo	S. Sgaw	
breathe, breath	A	D	D	D	D	В	A	
many, much	A	D	D	D	D	В	A	
muddy, turbid	A	D	D	D	D	В	A	
paddy, unhusked rice	A	D	D	D	D	В	A	
child	A	D	D	D	D	В	A	
evening	A	D	D	D	D	В	A	
right side	A	D	D	D	D	В	A	

*-S (Benedict, 1979:13)

PB TL five *njat^D *ŋas pungent, spicy hot * hat^D (B') *[hy]as *?nwet^D seven *hnəs to comb *khwis *khwit^D nine *?kus *kot^D bone * $khrwit^D$ ('B') *khrus carry by the headstrap *?büs * $?bwit^D$ (B') four PNK *lit^D, PCK *hlwi^A, PSK *lwi^B *lis

Conclusion

Between the two solutions, i.e. the *B' tone and the *-s, if I have to choose one, my preference would be the *-S. However, I wonder why the *-s has not been kept in any Pa-O and Pwo language varieties, since the speakers of Pa-O and Pwo have been in close contact with Austroasiatic speaking peoples both in the past and the present. It is known that Austroasiatic languages have final fricatives. To reach a definite conclusion, perhaps we need more solid data especially on Central Karen (CK) languages spoken in Myanmar collected by professional linguists and welltrained linguistic students.